+Bill Esmond[a] and Hayley Wood[a]

[a]College of Arts, Humanities and Education, University of Derby, Kedleston Road, Derby. DE22 1GB.

More morphostasis than morphogenesis? The 'dual professionalism' of English Further Education workshop tutors

Corresponding author:

Bill Esmond, College of Arts, Humanities and Education, University of Derby, Kedleston Road, Derby. DE22 1GB. Email: w.esmond@derby.ac.uk; tel. 01332 593768.

ORCID No. 0000-0002-9689-0807

More morphostasis than morphogenesis? The 'dual professionalism' of English Further Education workshop tutors

Abstract

An international repositioning of vocational teachers in relation to knowledge and the workplace is reflected in English Further Education through the terminology of 'dual professionalism'. Particularly in settings most closely linked to specific occupations, this discourse privileges occupational expertise that vocational educators bring from their former employment alongside pedagogic expectations of the teaching role. In a qualitative study of recently-qualified teachers employed substantially in workshop settings, using the analytical framework of Margaret Archer, workplace skills and generic attributes provided a basis for claims to expertise, extending to a custodianship of former occupations. Further augmentation of educator roles, however, appeared constrained by market approaches to development and employment insecurity in the sector and beyond. In Archer's terms, the current environment appears to cast 'dual professionalism' as morphostasis, drawing on former practice at the expense of teacher identity in the face of insecurity. Morphogenesis into enhanced professional teacher identities, for example developing coherent vocational pedagogies informed by research into advances in knowledge, **appears the less likely outcome** in the current and emerging sector.

Keywords: Dual professionalism; vocational educators; teacher education; work-based learning; vocational pedagogy; critical realism

Introduction

A repositioning of the relationship of vocational educators to knowledge and employment is evident across several jurisdictions, raising new questions about the occupational roles, expertise and identity of vocational teachers. Employment skills policies, marshalled in support of the economies of older industrial countries, have enhanced expectations of educators and their professional formation, just as market policies are reshaping initial teacher education (ITE) across phases and sectors (OECD 2010, 2014; European Commission 2015a). The status of vocational educators remains widely overshadowed by that of teachers in general education and a widespread turn towards learning in the workplace has resulted in some displacement by assessor and other associate roles (Misra 2011; Moodie & Wheelahan 2012; ETF 2016a, 2016b). The range of possibilities for future educator roles as practitioners, experts, assessors, teachers or researchers in various fields is substantially determined by this positioning in relation to knowledge and work.

In the English further education (FE) sector, centred on the main public institutions of post-school vocational education but also including private training providers, expectations of the workforce have been discursively repositioned by notions of 'dual professionalism', particularly in standards designed to shape entry to the profession (Lingfield 2012; ETF 2014). On the surface, this acknowledgement of the subject knowledge of teachers represents the latest attempt to resolve a historically problematic relationship between occupationally-based knowledge and the pedagogic expertise of teachers, long acknowledged in the literature (Cotcroft 1958; Venables 1967; Robson 1998). However, these changes can also be located in broader policy shifts, both within UK government and long-term international policies, particularly in relation to a transformation of teacher education and to a general turn towards learning in the workplace (DfE 2012, 2016a; OECD 2014; European Commission 2015a, 2015b). More fundamentally, this discourse raises both the possibility of a substantial

enhancement of vocational educator roles as research-oriented facilitators of advanced practice and the threat of their substantial diminution into transmitters of routine workplace competences.

These issues are posed most starkly in vocational areas closest to workplace practice, where education proceeds the least through theoretical abstraction and the most through the direct demonstration and practice of workplace skills. **A model combining classroom-based teaching, which introduces fundamental concepts and technical knowledge, with the practice of occupational and craft skills in workshops that simulate workplace environments, has long been established in 'technical education'. The use of workshops for the skilled engineering and construction trades that dominated FE into the 1970s (Browne 1952; Cantor and Roberts 1972) has been widely adopted by additional areas, as colleges have been called to prepare less privileged groups for employment (or provide for its absence in times of high youth unemployment). What was once a model for part-time courses teaching young apprentices is now frequently deployed on full-time 'pre-vocational' courses with a high level of practical activity for less academic learners. Young (2006) broadly differentiated this 'occupational' route from the more 'general vocational' (i.e. imitative of academic) route that sprang up with the expansion of post-compulsory education from the 1980s and often provided progression to higher education, further marginalising the directly occupational strand within post-school education. Whilst A-levels and their 'general vocational' equivalents contributed to the expansion of further education at a time of high unemployment, such programmes as the Youth Training Scheme led to the introduction of courses in new areas, such as vehicle engineering and beauty therapy. These provided post-school education for wider numbers of young people but seldom provided access to the same kind of privileged employment as older craft areas.**

Correspondingly, older craft areas once employed a workforce 'drawn from a predominantly male working-class elite of skilled manual and technical workers' employed for its familiarity with commercial practice rather than its pedagogic expertise (Simmons 2010, 365). In turn, the expansion of FE to less privileged strata drew in educators with expertise from less privileged occupations, sometimes employed in 'associate professional' roles such as workplace assessors, rather than as teachers. A greater emphasis on teaching skills followed the introduction of mandatory teacher education between 2007 and 2012, when the proportion of trained teachers has increased across FE, albeit slowly (Thompson 2014). In an important sense, educators in these fields might be taken as ideal types for the 'dual professional' teacher. Additional policy attention to these fields has been demonstrated by the CAVTL Report (2013), whilst accounts of 'vocational pedagogy' (Lucas, Spencer and Claxton 2012) suggest that work practices can not only provide the source of knowledge but determine the means by which this is taught. However, Robson (1998) noted an important tension between this subject expertise and pedagogic practice, where new teachers are likely to fear that relevant occupational skills will be eroded over time by changes in technique, undermining a credibility 'bound up with their industrial and commercial experiences' (Robson 1998: 591). This tension remains unresolved, particularly in these settings, where teachers risk substitution by associate professional roles also described as 'dual professionals' (Skills Funding Agency 2015a, 2015b) and concerns about job security and deregulation are widespread.

This paper therefore examines these how this renewed emphasis on workplace expertise plays out in the practices and professional formation of these vocational educators. The study was conducted among tutors who teach on vocational programmes which include substantial workshop sessions, seeking out recently-trained teachers to explore how such educators relate industry-based knowledge and skills to broader understandings of

educational practice and the acquisition of teacher identities. The significance of wider institutional or structural factors shaping their decisions and their accounts was examined through the use of Margaret Archer's (1995) analytical framework to explore how the agency of vocational teachers develops in response to the material and cultural realities of the sector and wider society. This provides important indications of how far recent policies, including those for teacher education, have promoted the enhancement or diminution of vocational teacher roles and identities.

The paper begins by contextualising the study, firstly by situating the emergence of 'dual professionalism' discourses within further education within the long-term history of the sector. Secondly, broad policy developments reshaping teacher professional formation internationally are examined for their significance in vocational education. A wider turn to workplace learning is then discussed as part of a repositioning of vocational education in relation to employment and knowledge. **These developments are discussed in the following section and together represent the reconstruction of the conditions, or structure, within which the agency of teaching professionals develops. Later sections examine empirical evidence of the development of teaching professionalism among workshop tutors in practice.**

Background

Changes to ITE requirements in England can be located within a long struggle to create permanent institutions and a professional workforce for vocational education. A central dilemma was described by Cantor & Roberts (1972):

> The teacher in a local technical college tends not to regard himself primarily as a teacher of a specific subject like mathematics or technical drawing, but rather

identifies with his former profession and considers himself an engineer or

draughtsman who happens to be teaching (Cantor & Roberts 1972: 185).

This tension has long been endemic to the sector and the situation had changed little in many

areas when New Labour governments influenced by 'human capital' theories (Sung and

Ashton 2002; Leitch 2006) introduced mandatory teaching qualifications for the FE sector,

underpinned by detailed teaching standards and from 2007 reinforced by compulsory

membership of a 'professional' body, the Institute for Learning. Bathmaker and Avis (2013)

contrasted this approach to the more practical concerns of many teachers: 'their relationship

with students, teaching and learning, and their subject specialism' (Bathmaker & Avis 2013,

752). Acknowledging these tensions, the terminology of 'dual professionalism' was included

in the LLUK (2007) teaching standards. It assumed additional significance following the

election of a Conservative-led coalition government in 2010, when the first Lingfield Report

(2012) held that teaching qualifications were a matter for 'local decision-making and

individual responsibility' (2). Effectively re-assigning teaching expertise from a regulatory

requirement to a function of local labour markets, Lingfield (2012) explicitly compared what

tutors had learnt in their earlier employment to teacher education programmes, describing

these as 'largely generic and theoretical, rather than being related to the professional and

occupational expertise of college lecturers' (Lingfield 2012: 14). The new regulatory body for

the sector, the Education and Training Foundation (ETF), described teachers as 'both subject

and/or vocational specialists and experts in teaching and learning' in their simplified teaching

standards (ETF 2014). Discussion of dual or multiple professionalisms has become a staple of

its practitioner publication, *In-Tuition,* as though such practice were an unproblematic matter

for the agency of teachers.

**Yet the use of this terminology to describe FE teachers provides no account of
how existing structures shape the way occupational knowledge is transformed into
pedagogy, or how the tutor's relation to workplace knowledge changes. The**

deregulation of ITE has diminished the prospect of a fully teacher-trained workforce without providing any identifiable route to subject expertise: changes to the workforce have tended to reduce the proportion of qualified teachers in the FE workforce. Whilst most colleges still require teaching qualifications for the core workforce, the diversion of resources towards apprenticeships, mainly offered by private training providers, has correspondingly increased the number of educators working in non-teaching roles. Within the further education workforce, teaching staff numbers have fallen by 12% over the three years to 2014-15 but only by 6% for work-based assessors and learning support staff; there are higher-than-average falls in subjects where assessors are widely used to support workshop sessions, such as construction, hairdressing and beauty therapy (ETF 2016a, p.43). Whilst data is less complete for private training providers, who manage the great majority of apprenticeships, the ETF found that three-quarters of their teaching and training staff worked in assessor roles by this point, a proportion that had trebled since 2011/12 (2016b, p.3). A further re-alignment of teaching roles is inherent within the implementation of work placements arising from the Sainsbury Review and Skills Plan (DfE 2016a, 2016b). These changes constitute a substantial reconstruction of the VET workforce and of the structures that pre-exist the agency of teachers. This can in turn be located within two major international trends: a heightened policy interest in teacher education across all sectors and phases of education and a significant turn to workplace learning.

Teacher Education has been reshaped internationally as education has become central to the social and economic policies of governments in older industrialised economies, leading both to heightened expectations and market reforms. Firstly in the Liberal Market Economies (Hall and Soskice 2001) but increasingly elsewhere, teacher education policies have focused on taught academic subjects, performance and entry-route diversity (Cochran-Smith 2005).

The decline of education degrees as a route into US school teaching in favour of liberal arts degrees and postgraduate teaching certificates, 'the hallmark of the teaching professional inscribed in the No Child Left Behind Act' (Cochran-Smith 2005, p. 12), accompanied such diversification of routes as the widely-imitated Teach for America. **The pace of such changes varies across jurisdictions and is attenuated by varying commitments to social cohesion (Green 2006). Nevertheless, the introduction of market-driven diversity into teacher education represents more than a subjective preference among policymakers but is integral to neo-liberal policies within which education's role in all phases is to develop a workforce attractive to investors of mobile capital (Hursh 2007; Olssen and Peters 2005). Thus, even in jurisdictions where neo-liberal policies have been adopted with greater caution,** more recent and yet more rapid developments have included a recent sharp turn in Swedish teacher education towards 'academic subject knowledge and technical and behavioural knowledge related to how to select and "teach" this content effectively' (Beach and Bagley 2013, 383). This echoes an earlier transition in the UK, since the James Report **(1972)** began to emphasise schools-based practice at the expense of theoretical exploration in educational disciplines. This movement towards diversity has reached its farthest point yet in the re-location of teacher training within schools (Schools Direct) and notions of 'evidence-based practice' (Ellis and McNicholl 2015). Yet coherent alternative accounts of teacher professionalism have also been influential, such as Sachs's (2001) analysis of democratic and managerialist professional identities or Whitty's (2006) broader conceptualisation of professionalism. Performative regulation and emphasis on received subject knowledge contend with notions of the teacher-as-researcher, albeit in different forms across different jurisdictions (Munthe and Rogne 2015).

These broad developments play out rather differently in English vocational education. Here knowledge is increasingly seen as located not in the hands of subject experts in

educational settings but within the workplace. Specialisation within the sector is not reinforced but undermined by the diverse entry routes central to neo-liberal policies. The generic entry routes offered by awarding bodies, including short courses and 'assessor' qualifications for work-based learning, have provided little focus on specialist curriculum or pedadogy. The first teacher training colleges, established in the 1940s, offered distinctive routes such as building, business, engineering and science, with further local specialisms: mining at Bolton, tailoring and textiles at Huddersfield, printing and nautical subjects at Garnett, agriculture at Wolverhampton (Cantor & Roberts 1972, 197-8). Now a more dispersed ITE retains few specialist routes and programmes of FE teacher education rely largely on subject-specific mentors to support trainees in colleges.

Moreover, the greater emphasis on workplace knowledge reflects an international turn towards workplace learning. The Riga Conclusions adopted by VET ministers in the European Union began with a commitment to 'promote work-based learning in all its forms' (European Commission 2015b) and this extends to the learning of vocational teachers, even at higher levels (OECD 2014). In England, the introduction of work placements to college 16-19 programmes is to be redoubled as a result of the Sainsbury Review (DfE 2016a) and Skills Plan (DfE 2016b). Yet it remains unclear that this will lead to more intensive teaching of vocational specialisms. The 'return to subjects' (Young 2011) begun by the coalition government after 2010 has emphasised the intrinsic worth of traditional academic subjects, so that mathematics and English have been introduced as additional but distinctive, often unrelated, elements of study programmes, rather than as concepts to be learnt in industry contexts. Correspondingly, learning for the workplace is increasingly described less in relation to specific subjects than in terms of generic outcomes and 'soft skills' associated with a growing service sector and a greater emphasis on service elements in manufacturing. Despite policy emphasis on 'advanced' skills, technological advances may reduce the scope

for employee discretion to apply them (Keep 2011; Grugulis and Vincent 2009). Thompson and Smith (2010) note that:

> … significant shifts in the definition and nature of skills. The most prominent of these has been the rise of 'generic' skills with the shift to service work – adaptability, motivation, cooperativeness – many of which are attitudes, social predispositions and character traits (Thompson & Smith 2010: 16).

These broad-based attributes feature in the CAVTL Report (2013), which referred to unspecified 'work-related attributes [...] central to the development of occupational expertise' (2013, 16). In their account of 'subject-specific pedagogies' Lucas, Spencer and Claxton (2012) listed such outcomes 'critical to understanding working competence,' as 'business-like attitudes' and 'wider skills for growth' (2012, 46). These authors draw on Sennett's (2009) account of craftsmanship, which associates craft with mobility, legitimating a hierarchical authority beyond the large-scale enterprises of the twentieth century. Its practical significance is illustrated in Gamble's (2001) study of apprentice training workshops in South Africa, where the tacit transmission of skills contrasted with the explicit communication of 'moral' aspects relating to workplace behaviour. Gamble (2010) described this transmission of moral order as a mediator of knowledge transmission in craft education. These detailed observations coincide with a long-term narrowing of the vocational curriculum, associated with an increased emphasis on generic skills and a diminution of contextual knowledge (Wheelahan 2015). Significantly, the work experience provided within colleges for learners to practise skills away from the pressures of the workplace has found little favour in the recent turn to workplace learning. The DfE (2013) suggested that these experiences were no substitute for learning at the point of production:

> Providers' realistic working environments, such as college companies, provide good opportunities for students to develop initial vocational skills, knowledge and

employability skills. However, they should progress to external work experience at the earliest possibility, especially if work experience is a substantial part of their programme (DfE 2013, p. 11).

Thus industry expertise is seen as the property of the workplace notwithstanding the largely incidental nature of workplace learning. Workshop environments remain the areas of colleges where concepts of 'dual professionalism' appears to have more coherence and relevance to the curriculum yet the relationship between vocational teaching and workplace knowledge remains loosely defined. **Taken together, market-driven changes to ITE, the workplace turn and the discourse of dual professionalism constitute the context within which teachers develop their personal understandings of professionalism. The following section reports the methodology and methods of inquiry by which the latter was examined.**

Methodology

In its exploration of 'dual professionalism' the study sought to examine the ways in which educators draw on repertoires from their industrial experience in their professional practice and in the adoption of teacher identity. Whilst entry into teaching roles may be seen as a simple addition to existing expertise, the study was designed to discover how tutors combined these roles to construct their identities, for example by differentiating themselves from others in craft or educational roles (Barth 1969).

However, this was not an interpretive study that privileged these perspectives as independent of material reality: research in vocational education has struggled to analyse the agency of actors in this diverse field where changing conditions of work frame the practice of educators (Gleeson and Knights 2006). The Transforming Learning Cultures Project (James and Biesta 2007) developed a nuanced approach to the study of local cultures in Further Education, which differ significantly across subject areas. However, Orr (2013) noted greater

similarities than differences across colleges, reflecting the way powerful managerial

structures affect all areas of contemporary FE; Warren and Webb (2007) questioned the extent

to which the emphasis on culture captured the significance of structure to agency. The study

addressed these problems through a critical realist approach, exploring the way that these

accounts of practice were shaped by, and have significance for, a world existing

independently of their explanations, envisaging 'dual professionalism' as a dialectical rather

an additive entity (Bhaskar 1993). The work of Margaret Archer provides an analytical

framework to accommodate both agency and structure, enabling the analysis of these

accounts as narratives of transformation and reproduction constructed in response to pre-

existing social conditions. In Archer's framework, changes in agency take place in response

to pre-existing structures, described as morphogenesis: the type of process that might be

expected as skilled workers take on teacher identities. By contrast, morphostasis describes the

maintenance or reproduction of the existing state through a lack of personal change. The

external world of structure can be differentiated between the realms of structure, including

the distribution of material goods, as well as social positions and roles related to these, and

the realm of culture, including propositional knowledge, ideas and beliefs (Archer 1995). A

key opportunity for change is the practice of reflexivity and 'internal conversations' offer the

prospect of adopting differing stances towards these objective conditions and these can

provide the basis of social change (Archer 2003, 2007). However, the influence of structure

remains inherent even in the socialisation processes envisaged by Archer's account of the

'reflexive imperative' rather than dissolving as in notions of 'reflexive modernity' (Archer

2012). This framework, capturing both possibilities of agency and acknowledging the

continued significance of structure in spite of its diminution, was seen as appropriate to

capturing the circumstances within which professionals make their choices about educational

practice and teacher identity.

Following approval by a university ethics panel, a sample of such educators was therefore constructed from tutors working in colleges and teaching in workshop environments for a substantial part of their working week (n=6). Those interviewed were employed across three colleges in the English Midlands and their occupational backgrounds ranged from the traditional crafts taught in colleges since before the First World War to the more recent additions discussed above, developed to support training schemes during the 1980s. All were male: one (Luke) worked in hospitality, two (Aidan and Ben) in construction, one (Mick) in fabrication and welding, and two in motor vehicle engineering (Terry and Martin). All had worked in industry during the previous five years and therefore had relatively up-to-date skills on which to draw in their teaching. They had also completed a university-based initial teacher education course within the last two years.

The intention to explore the agency and interpretations of participants suggested an inquiry based on interview data, rather than the empirical observation of practice, since the reflexive accounts of educators were central to the study. Extended, semi-structured interviews were conducted and transcribed in full, before analysis using initial codes around teaching practice, professional development and identity drawn from policy and academic literature. An iterative coding process was then developed, initially seeking to identify new themes on the basis of patterns in respondents' accounts of action and fields of perception, drawing on broad inductive methods developed by contemporary adherents of grounded theory (Morse et al., 2009). However, further stages of coding sought to move on from interpretive approaches and to link the explanations offered by respondents to contemporary developments in Further Education and wider employment. These together constitute the objective structures within which vocational educators undertake the project of professional formation. Drawing on Archer's argument that agency proceeds at a different pace

within existing structures but has the potential to change these in the longer term, the paper explores the possibilities for vocational educators to adopt a higher level of practice. Key findings are set out in the following section.

Findings and discussion

In interviews focused on the educational practices and identities of workshop teachers, it is unsurprising that data included claims to expertise based on knowledge of workplace methods as well as teaching skills. However, in contrast to an unproblematic conception of 'dual professionalism' as the agentic addition of pedagogic expertise to occupational knowledge, analysis of the data explored how tutors' relationship to occupational knowledge changed from the role of an industrial practitioner applying knowledge in an occupational field, to that of a subject expert developing and sharing further knowledge, within the existing context of the sector and teacher preparation. In Archer's approach, such a morphogenetic change in outlook can only take place within pre-existing irreducible, autonomous and relatively enduring social structures, which 'pre-date any cohort of occupants/encumbants' (1995, p. 168). Such pre-existing structures had enabled respondents to become vocational educators but also had the potential to perpetuate identities based on former industrial roles, the transmission of workplace cultures and the socialisation of learners into industrial power structures, resulting in morphostasis and the reproduction of existing social forms.

Respondents had recently completed teacher education programmes that provided opportunities to examine critically their own practice and its context, including the reflexive internal conversations described by Archer as 'a transcendentally necessary condition for the working of any society' (2003, p.31). However, this agency

develops in response to pre-existing structure and culture. This has tended to perpetuate relatively weak framing (Bernstein 1996) in workshop teaching and the informal facilitation of practical activities. Mick described a pattern of workshop practice common to many subjects and institutions:

> A little bit of a chat about where everybody is, what progress they've made, what they're working on at the moment and what they're aiming for through the sessions and then everyone sets off on individual tasks. It's very rare that you get people working as groups unless they're on the same thing at the same point. And my job is just to facilitate them working through smoothly and making sure they've got something to be getting on with at all times… Other workshop courses… you still do your demonstrations, you're still going to set up peer to peer work, you're still going to set up student mentors for those that are struggling. I think it's pretty similar, the ways you can go about doing it, it's just a different subject.

This all-purpose description of workshop teaching portrays this role as drawing on industry-based expertise to support practical learning. However, the relatively limited ambition to 'mak[e] sure they've got something to be getting on with at all times' falls short of the kind of abstraction and recontextualisation of knowledge that might be expected as part of a fully developed morphogenesis. As Hordern (2016) has pointed out, the differentiation of knowledge tends to lag behind differentiation in occupational practice and this could provide a focus for the development of vocational knowledge; but this is generally reduced to routine activities loosely described as 'professional updating' rather than systematic inquiry.

Perhaps for similar reasons, participants advanced relatively weak accounts of the transmission of occupational knowledge through subject-specialist vocational pedagogy, despite persistent interview questions. Participants mentioned demonstrations, with Ben producing a complex joint with which he was able to quickly impress students and Aidan's description of talking his class through the process of hanging a door, perhaps a more

interactive approach. Ben for example offered suggestions peripheral to learning the trade: maths, practical group work, a charity project and its business aspects, but nothing directly related to occupational knowledge:

> Specific practices? I'm still finding it hard … I can't think… I can't really specify what it is that we do that's different. Probably lots of things but I can't think of them.

This inability to name practice specific to particular occupations reflects a genericism in vocational teaching that has diminished attention both to abstract technical knowledge as well as to practical craft skills. Notwithstanding current emphasis on 'craftsmanship' in current academic commentaries (e.g. Lucas, Spencer and Claxton 2012), reflected in Martin's comment that learners needed 'to do a job not quite right so they prove right in the future', respondents were unable to describe advances either in knowledge of their own subjects or in teaching it. The policy developments outlined above have not provided the space for a genuine, morphogenetic augmentation of professionalism.

Ironically, respondents had added new areas of 'expertise' to their teaching, not in their occupational specialisms but as responses to shortages of experts in other fields. Terry taught for twelve hours 'outside my specialism'; Mick's trade background was welding but he taught fabrication, 'stuff I learnt about once I started teaching'; Martin had worked on car bodies but also taught mechanical skills, as well as maths and English, 'where learners will absorb it better because it's something they want to know and are interested in'. This 'subject mobility' both undermines simple notions of dual professionalism and holds out the promise that teaching has the possibility of moving beyond low-level genericism. Changing relationships to knowledge provide more meaningful opportunities for morphogenesis, as the acquisition of new skills and knowledge can provide the basis for more advanced, research-informed teaching

practices. Yet respondents reported few opportunities to research advances in their own field. Indeed, just as 'lifelong learning' gives individuals the responsibility to make themselves employable, colleges assume no obligation for teachers to upgrade their vocational knowledge. Mick observed that such changes to technology and practice had different implications for employees and teachers:

> Part of being a teaching professional is keeping up to date with all the relevant knowledge and all the skills and making sure that you've got the confidence to do it. In industry... if something came in the company would send you on training, it was their job to make sure everyone could do what they needed to do. As a teaching professional it's mine.

Such a lack of opportunity for subject-based learning reflects a sector where development activities focus almost exclusively on pedagogic or administrative issues. Discourses of research-based teaching are seldom heard in the sector and have a hollow echo. The subject specialism of vocational tutors is either developed in private limited spaces that individuals are able create against all the pressures in the current sector, or remains rooted in the past.

Such links to past occupational expertise, without at least the aspiration to develop knowledge and apply it in new ways, conforms much more closely to Archerian notions of morhpostasis. Rather than differentiate themselves from teaching colleagues in terms of their expertise as teachers, respondents compared themselves to colleagues with outdated industrial skills: 'good lecturers who haven't worked on the systems we're teaching' (Terry), who:

> … do keep up to speed with it; but 'cause they're in their sixties, they'll do some things which they've done all their life which are unheard of on site now (Aidan)

This reliance on **industry expertise appeared to clash with rather than facilitate confident adoption of teacher identities. Yet respondents were also aware of**

changes that served to undermine their expertise: Aidan described how recent site visits had shown him new techniques in use, with assemblies that were easy to install, 'like lego'. The skills that go into creating products which require less adaptation can provide new opportunities for teachers to enhance their expertise. Yet identification with past skills extended to the way that respondents described themselves as preparing learners for the workplace. Here the retention of skilled-worker identities emerged in expressions of concern to enable learners to meet the requirements of their own industries and craft groups, even at the expense of institutional requirements:

> Making sure they leave as good chefs is crucial to me, rather than making sure they have done one smart target… There's a whole host of skills really, in terms of organisation, management of yourself and teamwork of others… what being a chef needs to be and understanding the commitment of what the industry is asking for, passion and enthusiasm for the subject (Luke).

This identification with respondents' former roles extended to an avowed custodianship of their former industries and occupations. Whilst Luke referred to 'passion and enthusiasm' others focused on product quality or the exacting conditions of employment compared to workshop-based learning:

> I make it so that their entire experiences are realistic... I'm not signing you off until you've done it at least somewhere near a standard that's good enough to be accepted in industry (Terry).

> In an industry workshop, you'll be given a list of jobs to do and you'll be given a set time to do them in and if you haven't done them you get done in for it… You can go and ask for help and advice but you're not going to get someone coming off their job to show you how to do yours better. They're going to give you 30 seconds of input and that's the best you'll get because they've got their job to do as well… you've got to keep turning out the profits. (Mick).

These characterisations of the workplace reflect the power structures of industries that have experienced intensification over the last thirty years, with an increased emphasis on the performance of individual tasks. Perhaps surprisingly, respondents' characterisation of their former employment as a primary source of their pre-eminence extended to the 'demonstrators' or 'vocational coaches' recruited to supplement (or replace) teachers in workshop settings. The interview schedule specifically probed how respondents would differentiate themselves from such non-teaching employees, expecting responses that defined the teacher role. Yet the principal criticism of non-teaching staff was their limited industry knowledge, again suggesting that their identification with skilled workers roles and industrial power structures remained stronger than their teacher identities, in spite of respondents' personal successes as teachers.

The influence of external structure was made explicit in data on employment uncertainty. Half of the sample were seeking admission to permanent roles: Mick, who had worked full-time but on hourly-paid contracts for two years, described teaching as 'a pretty big risk' with years of training and 'this possibility you may never get a permanent position because of the way colleges are working'. His own search for permanent employment, despite his in-demand skills, was 'like trying to fly to the moon on a paper aeroplane.' Those in permanent roles also discussed the possibility of returning to industry and within six months of these interviews, half the respondents had moved from the FE colleges where they were employed. **The insecurity of employment promoted by market policies in the sector has helped to reconstitute structures that pre-exist agency in the sector, so that the Archerian 'reflexive project' of becoming a vocational teacher is less achievable because of the difficulty of securing or retaining teaching roles. Against this background, industry expertise was deployed to advance stronger claims to employment roles than**

colleagues with more teaching experience, irrespective of their varying work experience, ranging from Ben's decades of skilled work to Aidan's six years of workshop employment, a period shorter than early twentieth-century apprenticeships. For those who, like Terry, still worked part-time and described their continuing work in such roles as a means of updating, industry skills also remained a possible source of future employment, whilst funding cuts in the sector made permanent transitions into teaching more uncertain.

Further evidence of morphostasis is suggested by respondents' descriptions of practice in terms of generic behaviours and attributes deemed appropriate for employment. Their accounts did not reflect on behavioural management in the classroom but focused on the workplace behaviour they sought to model. This included benevolent aspects of what might be described as moral education: the need to behave safely in dangerous environments, or to work collaboratively with others. Ben was conscious of the need to treat young people with greater care than he had exercised with employees in his trade 'dealing with them rough-rod, barging your way through situations'. Yet the same account emphasised the perceived need for resilience and 'grit' emerging in contemporary educational discourse:

> The biggest skill that I brought to this is how to communicate with people that you want to get something from, that may not want to do something, to coax them into doing something: you learn a skill, to manage people and get the best from them. That's the main thing I learnt from industry because it's a tough industry and some days things go wrong and you've got to pick people up and move them forward.

There were moral undertones of the behaviours appropriate for skilled workers, or for 'a human being… a functioning member of the public' (Aidan) such as swearing in dealings with customers during installation work. This emphasis on attributes for employment has less to do with specific industry knowledge than with expectations of compliance appropriate to a modern world of mobile employment (Gamble 2009). **This moral education lies beyond**

subject-specific knowledge and 'subject pedagogy' yet in many ways it appears central to the workplace turn, with socialisation into workplace cultures a widely-advocated benefit of work placements and apprenticeships. Such cultural aspects of externality share with power structures a central place in Archer's account of morphostasis: the reproduction of workplace hierarchy constitutes at least a significant element of the workplace socialisation referred to by all respondents.

Conclusion

This small-scale study captures the responses of a small sample at a particular moment in the **history** of vocational education in one country. Its significance lies in the comparison of accounts from an area often neglected by research to emerging policies and their implementation. These areas were among the last to be staffed with qualified teachers but as a result of the 2007 regulations greater numbers have found their way onto ITE programmes, encountering critical approaches to educational practice. This provides traction for an examination of dual professionalism discourses that are too easily presented as the simple addition of pedagogic to workplace skills. This neglects both structural and cultural aspects of the context for further education.

More broadly, this additive formulation also misses a crucial opportunity to reconceptualise the role of the vocational educator. Whilst the UK model of vocational education has frequently been criticised for its disjuncture from employment in comparison to other (for example European) systems, current policies unquestionably seek to erode the boundaries between institution-based learning and the workplace. This has the potential to provide all contributors to learning for work with opportunities for morphogenesis. Skilled employees might for example play a more conscious role in developing new employees or placement learners; assessors of routine occupational knowledge might undertake more developmental activities; college-based

teachers would seek to enhance both industry-oriented and pedagogic expertise, effectively moving morphogenetically towards research-oriented roles that encompassed advanced technical or professional knowledge and critical engagement with educational practice. These shifts would necessarily entail require an open acknowledgment of the repositioning of vocational teachers in relation to knowledge over time; as well as a more explicit acknowledgment of educative purposes. However, such notions are rarely advanced in routine discussion of teacher professionalism: that individuals draw on their former occupational expertise in their teaching hardly constitutes a coherent integration of education with the workplace. Moreover, the potential for morphogenesis inherent within any realignment of education and employment depends on how this is organised and resourced.

In this lies the significance of the present study. For these respondents, earlier work experience shapes the practices and identities described in these accounts, but with far less clarity and in far less favourable circumstances than the policy discourse suggests. Neither industry skills nor vocational pedagogies have been identified with the degree of specificity suggested by notions of 'dual professionalism'. Nor does an unproblematised turn towards the workplace without appropriate resources provide a basis for the enhancement of industry-specific learning. Within further education, following several years of diminishing resources as well as perpetual restructuring and mergers, such as the recent 'Area Reviews', the structures emerging from market-based 'dual professionalism' have largely served to promote insecurity and weak teacher identities. If the emerging workplace turn continues these trends, the agency of teachers is more likely to result in morphostasis than morphogenesis, deepening the challenges for vocational educators, institutions and teacher education.

References

Archer, M.S. 1995. *Realist Social Theory: the Morphogenetic Approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Archer, M.S. 2003. *Structure, Agency and the Internal Conversation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Archer, M.S. 2007. *Making Our Way through the World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Archer, M.S. 2012. *The Reflexive Imperative in Late Modernity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bathmaker, A.M. and J. Avis. 2013. "Inbound, outbound or peripheral:the impact of discourses of 'organisational' professionalism on becoming a teacher in English further education," *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 34:5, 731-748, DOI:10.1080/01596306.2013.728367

Barth, F. 1969. 'Introduction,' in F. Barth (ed.) *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries: the Social Organization of Culture Difference.* Oslo: Universitetsforlaget.

Beach, D. and C. Bagley. 2013. "Changing Professional Discourses in Teacher Education Policy Back towards a Training Paradigm: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Teacher Education* 36 (4): 379-392, DOI: 10.1080/02619768.2013.815162.

Bernstein, B. 1996. Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: Theory, research, critique. London: Taylor and Francis.Bhaskar, R. 1993. *Dialectic: The Pulse of Freedom*. London: Verso.

Browne, J.W. 1952. The organisation of a Technical College Engineering workshop, *The Vocational Aspect of Education,* 4:9, 132-148, DOI:10.1080/03057875280000151..

Cantor, L. M. & F.I. Roberts. 1972. Further Education Today, 2nd Edition. London: Routledge.

CAVTL (Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning). 2013. *It's About Work: Excellent adult vocational teaching and learning.* London: BIS/Learning and Skills Improvement Service.

Cochran-Smith, M. 2005. "The New Teacher Education: For Better or for Worse?" *Educational Researcher* 34 (7): 3-1. DOI: 10.3102/0013189X034007003.

Cotcroft, S.F. 1958. *Technical Education and Social Change.* Paulton: George Allen & Unwin.

DfE (Department for Education). 2012. *Study Programmes for 16- to 19-year-olds: Government response to consultation and plans for implementation.* London: DfE.

DfE. 2013. *Post-16 work experience as a part of 16-19 Study Programmes*. London: DfE.

DfE. 2016a. *Report of the Independent Panel on Technical Education.* London: DfE.

DfE. 2016b. *16-19 Skills Plan.* London: DfE.

ETF (Education & Training Foundation). 2014. *Professional Standards for Teachers and Trainers in Education and Training – England*. London: ETF.

ETF. 2016a. *Workforce data across the Further Education sector 2014-15: Summary of findings from analysis of administrative and survey data.* London: ETF.

ETF. 2016b. *Private Training Providers' Workforce in 2014-15: Findings based on work-based learning survey evidence.* London: ETF.

Ellis, V. and J. McNicholl. 2015. *Transforming Teacher Education: Reconfiguring the Academic Work.* London: Bloomsbury.

European Commission. 2015a. "Working Group on Vocational Education and Training: Teachers and Trainers in Work-based learning." *Education and Training 2020: Working Group Mandates 2016-18,* pp. 18-24.

European Commission. 2015b. *Riga Conclusions.* [online] at http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/education_culture/repository/education/policy/vocational-policy/doc/2015-riga-conclusions_en.pdf.

Gamble, J. 2001. "Modelling the Invisible: The pedagogy of craft apprenticeship," *Studies in Continuing Education*, 23:2, 185-200.

Gamble, J. 2009. Knowledge and identity in the mobile workplace, in Weil, M., L. Koski and L. Mjelde (eds.) *Knowing Work: The Social Relations of Working and Knowing.* New York: Peter Lang, pp. 51-76.

Gamble, J. 2010. Exploring the Transmission of Moral Order as Invisible Semiotic Mediator of Tacit Knowledge, pp. 121-140 in P. Singh, A. R. Sadovnik, S.F. Semel and J. Gamble (eds). *Toolkits, translation devices and conceptual accounts: essays on Basil Bernsteins's sociology knowledge.*

Gleeson, D. and D. Knights. 2005. "Challenging Dualism: Public Professionalism in 'Troubled' Times," *Sociology* 20 (2): 277-295. DOI: 10.1177/0038038506062033.

Green, A. 2006. "Models of Lifelong Learning and the 'knowledge society.'" *Compare,* 36 (3): 307–325. DOI: 10.1080/03057920600872449.

Grugulis, I. and S. Vincent. 2009. "Whose skill is it anyway? Soft skills and polarisation." *Work, Employment and Society*, 23 (4): 597 – 615. DOI: 10.1177/0950017009344862.

Hall, P. and D. Soskice. 2001.. 'Introduction' in P Hall and D. Soskice (eds.). *Varieties of Capitalism: The Institutional Foundations of Comparative Advantage.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hordern, J. 2016. "Differentiating knowledge, differentiating (occupational) practice," *Journal of Vocational Education & Training.* DOI: 10.1080/13636820.2016.1234506.

Hursh, D. 2007. "Assessing No Child Left Behind and the Rise of Neoliberal Education Policies." *American Educational Research Journal,* 44 (3): 493–518. DOI: 10.3102/0002831207306764.

James, D. and G. Biesta. 2007. *Improving Learning Cultures in Further Education.* Oxford: Routledge.

Keep, E.J. 2011. "The English skills policy narrative" in A. Hodgson, K. Spours and M. Warring (eds.) *Post-compulsory Education and Lifelong Learning Across the United Kingdom Policy: Organisation and Governance* pp. 18-38. London: Institute of Education.

LLUK (Lifelong Learning UK). 2007. *New overarching professional standards for teachers, tutors and trainers in the lifelong learning sector.* London: Lifelong Learning UK.

Leitch, A. 2006. *Review of Skills - Prosperity for all in the Global Economy – World Class Skills* (Final Report). Norwich: HMSO.

Lingfield, R. 2012. *Professionalism in Further Education: Interim Report of the Independent Review Panel*. London: Department of Business, Industry & Skills.

Lucas, B., Spencer, E & Claxton, G. 2012. *How to teach vocational education: A theory of vocational pedagogy,* London: City and Guilds.

Misra, P.K. 2011. "VET teachers in Europe: Policies, practices and challenges." *Journal of Vocational Education & Training* 63: 1, 27-45. DOI: 10.1080/13636820.2011.552732.

Moodie, G. & L. Wheelahan. (2012). Integration and fragmentation of post compulsory teacher education, *Journal of Vocational Education & Training,* 64:3, 317-331. DOI: 10.1080/13636820.2012.691535.

Morse, J.M., P.N. Stern, J. Corbin, B. Bowers, K. Charmaz and A.E Clarke. 2009. *Developing Grounded Theory: The second generation.* London: Routledge.

Munthe, E. and M. Rogne. 2015. 'Research based teacher education,' *Teaching and Teacher Education* 46: 17-24. DOI:/10.1016/j.tate.2014.10.006.

OECD. 2010. *Learning for Jobs: Synthesis Report of the OECD Reviews of vocational education and training.* OECD.

OECD. 2014.*Skills beyond School: Synthesis Report: OECD Reviews of secondary vocational education and training*. OECD.

Olssen, M. and M.A. Peters. 2005. "Neoliberalism, higher education and the knowledge economy: from the free market to knowledge capitalism." *Journal of Education Policy,* 20 (3): 313–345. DOI: 10.1080/02680930500108718.

Orr, K. 2013. Cultures, colleges and the development of ideas about teaching in English Further Education. *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 18: 4, 377-388. DOI: 10.1080/13596748.2013.847173

Robson, J. 1998. "A profession in crisis: status, culture and identity in the further education college," *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 50:4, 585-607.

Sachs, J. 2001. Teacher professional identity: competing discourses, competing outcomes, *Journal of Education Policy*, 16 (2): 149-161, DOI:10.1080/02680930116819

Sennet, R. 2009. *The Craftsman.* London: Penguin.

Simmons, R. 2010. "Globalisation, neo-liberalism and vocational learning: the case of English further education colleges." *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 15 (4): 363-376.

Skills Funding Agency. 2015a. *Education and Training Higher Apprenticeship Standard: Higher/Further Education - Assessor-Coach (AC).* Available at https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/471753/EDUCA TION_AND_TRAINING_Futher_Education_Assessor_Coach_FINAL.pdf.

Skills Funding Agency. 2015b. *Education and Training Apprenticeship Standard: Higher/Further Education - Learning Mentor (LM).* Available at https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/470022/EDUCA TION_AND_TRAINING_HigherFurther_Education_-_Learning_Mentor__LM_.pdf

Sung, J. and D. Ashton. 2005. *High Performance Work Practices: Linking Strategy and Skills to Performance Outcomes*. London: Department of Trade and Industry.

Thompson, P and C. Smith. 2010. Labour Process Theory in Retrospect and Prospect, in P. Thompson & C. Smith(eds.). *Working Life: Renewing Labour Process Analysis*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, p. 1-10 (Critical Perspectives on Work and Employment.)

Thompson, R. 2014. *Initial Teacher Education for the Education and Training Sector in England: Development and change in generic and subject-specialist provision.* London: Gatsby.

Venables, E. 1967. *The Young Worker at College.* London: Faber & Faber.

Warren, S. and S. Webb. 2007. "Challenging lifelong learning policy discourse: Where is structure in agency in narrative-based research?" *Studies in the Education of Adults,* 39, 5-21. DOI: 10.1080/02660830.2007.11661537.

Wheelahan, L. 2015. "Not just skills: what a focus on knowledge means for vocational education," *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 47(6): 750-762, DOI:10.1080/00220272.2015.1089942.

Whitty, G. 2006. Teacher professionalism in a new era. Paper presented at the first General Teaching Council for Northern Ireland Annual Lecture, Belfast, March.

Young, M. 2006. "Reforming the Further Education and Training Curriculum: An international perspective." In *Knowledge, Curriculum and Qualifications for South African Further Education*, ed. M. Young and J. Gamble, 46–63. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Young, M. 2011. The return to subjects: a sociological perspective on the UK Coalition government's approach to the 14–19 curriculum. The Curriculum Journal 22 (2): 265–278. DOI: 10.1080/09585176.2011.574994.